

MEETING

September 15, 2022

| INFORMATION  |  |  |  |
|--|--|--|--|
| <u>Virtual Meeting</u>                               | OPENING SESSI  | ON   |  |
| To join Virtually:                                   | Jill Rose, Chairperso  | n, called the meeting to order at 2:00 p.m.  |  |
| <u>https://orlando-</u><br>gov.zoom.us/j/99228810801 | Gabriella Isaac, Recording Secretary, conducted the Roll Call and determination of a quorum was confirmed.   |  |  |
| Time   | PUBLIC COMMENTS: NONE  |  |  |
| 2:00 p.m.  |  |  |  |
| Board Members Present:                               | MINUTES:   |  |  |
| Jill Rose- Chairperson                               | <u>Danny Gordon MOVED to waive the reading of the minutes and to approve the minutes of the</u><br><u>August 18, 2022, meeting as written. Patrick Panza SECONDED the motion, which was voted</u><br><u>upon and PASSED by unanimous voice vote (5-0).</u> |  |  |
| Clarisse Gates, Vice-Chair                           |  |  |  |
| Margaret Brock                                       | ANNOUNCEMENTS  |  |  |
| Daniel Gordon  | • None   |  |  |
| Chad Cowart  |  |  |  |
| Patrick Panza  | CONSENT AGENDA   |  |  |
| Board Members Absent                                 | 1. Case No:  | ARB2022-10036, DMS Hurston State Office Complex  |  |
| Margaret Brock                                       |  | Plaza Renovation- 400 W Robinson Street.   |  |
| Jeff Arms  | Applicant:   | Danita Bryant, CPH LLC   |  |
|  | Owner:<br>District:  | State of Florida<br>Commissioner District 5  |  |
|  | Project Planner:   | Max Spann  |  |
|  | Description:   | Major certificate of Appearance Approval for the renovation of the plaza                       |  |
|  |  | area between the two office towers and the addition of ADA parking spaces<br>on FAMU Law Lane. |  |

Recommended Action: Approval, based on the conditions in the staff report.

**MEETING MINUTES** 

ARB Staff has reviewed the proposed improvements to the plaza area located at 400 W. Robinson St., as well as the adjacent FAMU Law Ln. improvements and is recommending approval with the following conditions:

#### 1. Streetscape

#### A. Streetscape Design Guidelines

i. The FAMU Law Lane streetscape design and construction is required to comply with the design and construction requirements of the Downtown Orlando Streetscape Design Guidelines and the conditions in this staff report.

ii. City Services Easement — A City services easement shall be provided by the Owner for any portion of the 15-foot required streetscape zone outside of the right-of-way. The easement shall be up to 15-feet wide.

iii. Following construction, within the City Services Easement, no vertical impediments shall be allowed to remain outside of the five (5) foot furnishing zone.

Iv. Maintenance Agreement- The Owner shall enter into a maintenance agreement with the City to define

maintenance responsibilities for the streetscape zone and any proposed outdoor dining areas.

## **B.** General Streetscape Requirements

i. Street Trees — Sky Climber Live Oak trees shall be planted as the primary street tree on FAMU Law Ln. in tree wells in the streetscape as defined by the Downtown Orlando Streetscape Design Guidelines.

ii. Structural Soil—To minimize root damage to adjacent pavement areas, structural soil or a Planning Official ap- proved equivalent shall be installed around all canopy trees within the streetscape consistent with Detail 3.4-0 and 3.4-P of the Downtown Orlando Streetscape Guidelines.

iii. Street Lights—Double Acorn LED streetlights, consistent with the Downtown Orlando Streetscape Guidelines, shall be used along FAMU Law Ln. and spaced based on OUC lighting requirements. A Photometric plan much be provided for permitting.

iv. Valve and Junction Boxes—All at grade junction, valve and control boxes in the streetscape zone shall be traffic bearing grade boxes and lids. Box lids must be painted a color that matches the adjacent streetscape material.

## 2. Site Improvements

A. Design Intent—ARB Staff supports the design intent, site plan, materials, furniture and the proposed finishes of the project submitted in the ARB application package.

B. FAMU Law Lane On-Street Parking—ARB Staff supports the addition of the on-street parking spaces along FAMU Law Lane. However, approval of the City Parking Division and Transportation Engineering Division will be required prior to submittal of building permits.

## 3. Lighting

A. Parking Area Lighting—Lighting must be provided for all proposed parking areas. The light fixtures must be shielded and comply with the city lighting ordinance.

B. All exterior lighting fixtures will be reviewed by ARB Staff during the building permit process. All exterior lighting must comply with the city lighting code and a photometric plan must be included in the permit documents.

## 4. ARB Approval

A. Permits—ARB approval does not grant permission to construct or install improvements. All applicable permits must be obtained prior to commencement of demolition and/or construction activities.

B. Modifications to the approved ARB plans must be submitted to ARB staff for review and approval. Significant

modifications may require additional approval by the Appearance Review Board.

# 2. Case No: ARB2022-10043, Lake Avenue Relocation- 321 E South Street

| Applicant:       | Jaime L. Igua, PE VHB  |
|------------------|--|
| Owner:           | Suncoast Manor Foundation Inc.   |
| District:        | Commissioner District 4  |
| Project Planner: | Richard Forbes   |
| Description:     | Certificate of Appearance Approval for the relocation of Lake Avenue and associated work to the existing parking lots. |
|                  | the existing parking lots.   |

Recommended Action: Approval, based on the conditions in the staff report.

## 1. ARB Approval

- A. Minor modifications to this ARB approval will require additional ARB staff review and approval. Major modifications may require additional ARB board approvals.
- B. ARB approval does not grant permission to construct and/or install. All necessary permits must be obtained prior to commencement of installation activity.

## 2. Streetscape:

**a. South Street** – The South Street streetscape zone must meet the requirements of Treatment 5 in the Downtown Streetscape Design Guidelines [DSDG]. The streetscape zone must be a minimum of 15-feet wide with a 9-foot grass parkway strip, 6-foot sidewalk, double acorn streetlights and Cathedral Live Oaks as street trees east of the Lake Avenue spaced between 35 and 50 feet apart. Street trees west of Lake Avenue shall be Skyclimber Live Oak (or equivalent). The oak street trees on South Street east of Lake Avenue must be a minimum of 8-inches in caliper to mitigate for the specimen oak that will be impacted by the new Lake

Avenue. Canopy trees at the easternmost portion (south of the parking lot) shall be staggered similar to the area south of the Westminster Building.

**b. Liberty Avenue** – The Liberty Avenue streetscape zone must meet the requirements of Treatment 5 in the DSDG. At a minimum, the streetscape zone must be a minimum of 13-feet wide with a 7-foot grass parkway strip, 6-foot-wide sidewalk, double acorn streetlights, and Skyclimber Live Oak (or equivalent) street trees spaced between 25 and 40-feet apart.

**c.** Jackson Street – The Jackson Street streetscape zone must meet the requirements of Treatment 5 in the DSDG. The streetscape zone must be a minimum of 15-feet wide with 6-foot-wide sidewalks and 9-foot minimum parkway strip, double acorn streetlights, and Skyclimber Oak (or equivalent) street trees spaced between 25 and 40-feet apart. There is an existing mature oak tree in the right-of-way near the intersection of Liberty and Jackson that must be preserved. Two to three additional Cathedral Live oak street trees shall be added to the parkway on the north side of the eastern parking lot.

**d.** Lake Avenue—The Lake Avenue Streetscape zone must meet the requirements of Treatment 5 in the DSDG. Sidewalks shall be a minimum of 6 feet. Street trees shall be Skyclimber Live Oak. Street trees shall be planted along outside of the east ROW to shade the sidewalk on the east side of the street.

**e.** Crosswalks – Pedestrian crossing at all driveway cuts must be an alternative material that contrasts with the driveway material. Concrete paver crossings are not permitted. Reflective striping alone is also not permitted.

**f. Structural** Soil – To minimize root damage to adjacent pavement areas structural soil or an approved equivalent shall be installed around all canopy street trees consistent with Detail 3.4-O and 3.4-P of the Downtown Streetscape Guidelines.

**g. Street Lights** – Double acorn streetlights consistent with the Downtown Streetscape Design Guidelines shall be used on all streets and spaced based on the OUC lighting requirements. The streetlights shall be located no closer than 2-feet to any sidewalk connections to the on-street parking areas or intersection hardscape.

**h. Understory Trees** – Understory trees may be used as accent trees in the parkway areas between the street trees but shall be located no closer than 10 feet to any streetlight and 20' to any canopy tree.

**i. Pedestrian Paths** – Sidewalks and streetscape on all streets shall be constructed based on the requirements for Streetscape Treatment 4 of the Downtown Streetscape Design Guidelines. All cells in the sidewalk will be finished with 2"-3" troweled edges and a medium broom finish that is perpendicular to the centerline of the street consistent with Treatment 4 of the Downtown Streetscape Design Guidelines. Intersection corner treatments and on-street parking spaces shall be Lawrenceville brick and installed according to the guidelines for Downtown Streetscape Treatment 4.

j. Corner treatments shall provide two accessibility ramps at each corner perpendicular to the centerline.

Patrick Panza MOVED to approve the Consent Agenda subject to staff conditions Danny Gordon SECONDED the motion, voted upon, and PASSED by unanimous voice vote (5 -0).

# **REGULAR AGENDA**

# 3. Case No: ARB2022-10042, Residential Tower 110 W Jefferson Street - Courtesy

## Review.

| Applicant:       | Michael Comiskey, GREC Architects   |  |  |
|------------------|---|--|--|
| Owner:           | HHH Reilly Fund, LLC  |  |  |
| District:        | Commissioner District 5   |  |  |
| Project Planner: | Richard Forbes  |  |  |
| Description:     | Courtesy review of a 36-story mixed use building with 544 units, office and retail space. No Board Action Required. |  |  |

Recommended Action: No action required.

This item was presented by Richard Forbes, Appearance Review Official. Using PowerPoint, Mr. Forbes presented the proposed project, location, site photos, survey, elevations, overall project view, renderings, and staff courtesy comments.

Mike Comiskey (via zoom), 645 Michigan Ave. Suite 300, Chicago, IL 60611, representing GREC Architects. Mr. Comiskey addressed the increasement of units based off to an update of their survey from a request from the Zoning Board

Chairperson Rose opened the hearing to the public. No speaker requests were received.

In response to Board questions, Mr. Forbes addressed Gertrude's Walk concerns regarding pedestrian scale and explained that the work on the portion directly to the east of this site is finished. The Washington St. crossing is still under work, and the side of Jefferson St has been completed recently. Staff is asking for streetscape depths and widths as it will be an active area for pedestrians and bicycles on both Jefferson St. and Washington St., with a future trail extension on the south side of Washington Street.

Mr. Comiskey addressed Board concerns regarding blank spaces and solid walls on the North and West side.

Board member Cowart expressed that once the final review comes before the board, he would like to see more views of the ground level and detail explaining how the building interfaces with the sidewalk—considering future cycling infrastructure.

Board member Gordon echoed Mr. Cowart's comments on Gertrude Ave. to ensure it remained a pedestrian-friendly environment. He also requested the building to have a singular statement on the top, for the elevator core coming up on that north side with an opportunity, to take advantage of that to make some features.

Vice Chairperson Gates expressed that he likes that project and the orientation of the project, slabs extensions, and transparent guardrails. She would like clarification on the maintenance of the building and some of the features of the slabs since it looks to be designed around vegetation so that they maintain their appearance.

In response to Board members' concerns regarding the gradation of the slabs, Mr. Comiskey indicated that the concept of gradation at the bottom of the slab is to incorporate into the design the way the slabs extend beyond the enclosure as experience on the ground level to see these slabs disappear into the sky as they begin to blend in with the surroundings.

# 4. Case No: ARB2022-10046, Pine and Lake Mixed Use Tower 319 E Church St. Final

|                  | Review   |
|------------------|--|
| Applicant:       | Brooks Stickler, Kimley-Horn and Associates                                  |
| Owner:           | Multiple Owners-see application.   |
| District:        | Commissioner District 4  |
| Project Planner: | Richard Forbes   |
| Description:     | Major Certificate of appearance approval for a 33-story mixed used building. |

Recommended Action: Approval, based on the conditions in the staff report

## 1. ARB Approval

- A. Minor modifications to this ARB approval will require additional ARB staff review and approval. Major modifications may require additional ARB board approvals.
- B. ARB approval does not grant permission to construct and/or install. All necessary permits must be obtained prior to commencement of construction activity.
- 2. Transparency: The ground floor building walls facing all streets shall contain a minimum of 30% of transparent materials. A minimum of 15% transparency shall be provided on all floors facing the street above the ground level. All glass at the ground level shall be clear. Minimum light transmittance shall be 80%. High performance or low-e glass may be considered as an alternative with a minimum transmittance of 60%. No windows shall be dry-walled, or have permanent partitions installed on the interior to block natural surveillance. Tinted, reflective, or spandrel glass is not permitted.

## 3. Streetscape:

- a. East Pine Street requires a modified 15-foot-wide treatment 4 with paving to back of curb. Street Trees High-rise or cathedral live oaks shall be used as canopy trees where applicable. East Pine Street must also accommodate the future cycle track that will be located on the south side of Pine Street. Modifications to the Pine Street Streetscape shall require additional staff review.
- b. South Lake Avenue requires a 15-foot-wide modified treatment 4 with paving to back of curb. The goal is to retain at least one of the existing street trees that are currently located in the right of way. New street trees shall be High-rise or cathedral live oaks. If the existing Lake Avenue tree is unable to be retained, then additional street trees are required and will require additional staff review.
- c. East Church Street requires a 15-foot-wide modified treatment 4 with paving to back of curb. The goal is to retail one of the existing street trees that are currently located in the right of way. If the existing Church Street tree is unable to be retained then additional street trees are required and will require additional staff review. New street trees shall be High-rise or cathedral live oaks.
- d. Structural Soil To minimize root damage to adjacent pavement areas structural soil or an approved equivalent shall be installed around all canopy street trees consistent with Detail 3.4-O and 3.4-P of the Downtown Streetscape Guidelines.
- e. Street Lights Double acorn streetlights consistent with the Downtown Streetscape Design Guidelines shall be used on all streets and spaced based on the OUC lighting requirements. The street lights shall be located no closer than 2-feet to any sidewalk connections to the on-street parking areas or intersection hardscape.

- f. Pedestrian Paths Sidewalks and streetscape on all streets shall be constructed based on the requirements for Streetscape Treatment 4 of the Downtown Streetscape Design Guidelines. All cells in the sidewalk will be finished with 2"-3" troweled edges and a medium broom finish that is perpendicular to the centerline of the street consistent with Treatment 4 of the Downtown Streetscape Design Guidelines. Intersection corner treatments and on-street parking spaces shall be Lawrenceville brick and installed according to the guidelines for Downtown Streetscape Treatment 4.
- g. Corner treatments shall provide two accessibility ramps at each corner perpendicular to the centerline.
- h. The pedestrian crossing at the loading zone entry and garage entry and exit shall be raised to be at same grade as the sidewalk ad-jacent to the driveway in order to clearly define the pedestrian area. The crosswalk surface shall be Lawrenceville brick. Reflective paint alone is not acceptable, however may be used in conjunction with pavers or other surface to outline the pedestrian path for nighttime safety. The mid-block curb cuts into the garage shall meet the mid-block curb cut standard in the Downtown Streetscape Guidelines.
- i. Valve and Junction Boxes—All at grade junction, valve and control boxes shall be traffic bearing grade boxes and lids.
- 4. Principal Entrances. Each use enters on a separate façade and each entry has a special canopy. The canopies shall meet LDC 61.204 and not project closer than 24 inches from the back of curb or create a rain runoff issue onto the sidewalk.
- 5. Art. Art—the artwork proposed for the south and north entry areas shall be presented as part of an additional ARB Minor Review.
- 6. Parking Garage:
  - a) The parking garage podium shall have a solid opaque wall 42 inches high at all parking levels to block vehicle views. The parking garage shall be articulated architecturally on all elevations and designed to achieve an architectural unity with the remain-der of the building by reflecting the character, scale and massing of the occupied spaces of the building. Garage screening shall limit views into the garage. The metal screening shall have additional staff review to determine how effective the screening will be.
  - b) Garage lighting shall be shielded from view.
  - c) Angled exterior ramping shall not be visible from the right-of-way and shall be obscured from view through the use of exterior metal screening, or other alternative methods.
  - d) The slope of the grade preceding the exit of a parking garage shall not exceed 2% for a minimum of 25 feet.
  - e) Finished screening material shall wrap around from the Church Street façade onto the west wall of the garage a minimum of 20 feet.
- 7. Materials. Physical samples of the materials shall be provided to staff for approval prior to permits.
- 8. Pedestrian Scale Detailing. A durable stone, cast stone, pre-cast concrete, or such other material that may be deemed appropriate and durable by the Appearance Review Officer, shall be utilized along the base of the building, except where storefront glass is provided.
- 9. Existing Buildings on Site. There are five unprotected historic resources on site. Update the existing Florida Master Site Files (FMSF) with the State Division of Historical Resources (Copy to Orlando Historic Preservation Office) to include demolition date and recent photographs. Resources on site are 316 E Pine St (FMSF-OR00105), 108 S Lake Av (FMSF-OR03346), 111 S Lake Av (FMSF-OR03347), 319 E Church St (FMSF-OR03348), 323 E Church St (FMSF-OR03349).
- **10. Existing Trees on Site**. There are multiple large canopy trees on this site and within the ROW. These trees shall remain, at minimum, until such time as a building permit has been issued for the foundation of the building and construction commences.
- 11. Exterior Solid Doors. Security view panels shall be provided in all exterior solid doors to provide visibility for pedestrians exiting, including emergency exit doors.
- 12. Service Area/Utilities. All utilities, trash disposal pick-up, and other maintenance facilities shall be located on the interior of the parking garage, and not adjacent to the pedestrian sidewalks. All utilities must be screened from view.
- 13. Venting & Exhaust. All potential restaurant venting, and restaurant exhaust shall be directed to the roof of the building and shall not be visible from the public right-of-way. Restaurant venting is not permitted on any façade of the building. All other venting and exhaust for mechanical and utilities shall be a minimum of 10 ft. above grade and shall be integrated with the building design so as to be seamless with the overall architecture of the building.
- 14. Mechanical Equipment. All mechanical equipment shall be screened and meet the conditions of the LDC.
- **15. Backflow Preventer**. Backflow preventer[s] shall be located so as to not be directly visible from the right-of-way and should be screened from view where necessary. They shall be clearly identified on the final site plan.
- 16. Fencing. Any fencing on the site shall be an open, CPTED-approved fence, such as aluminum or wrought-iron picket fencing. Chain link fencing is prohibited.
- 17. Signage. A Master Sign Plan including both the residential, hotel and retail signage at the ground level shall be provided and reviewed as a separate ARB review prior to the issuance of building permits for exterior signage. It shall clearly show how signage will be allocated between the tenants and the site as a whole and provide placeholders for locations of proposed signage. High-rise signs are permitted where consistent with Sec. 64.246 of the Land Development Code but will require an ARB Major Review prior to permitting.
- 18. Sustainable design and construction methods. Water conservation, energy conservation, and low-maintenance landscape design are strongly encouraged.
- **19. Telecommunications Equipment Screening**. Buildings shall be designed to accommodate future placement of telecommunications equipment. Recommend screening.

Richard Forbes, Project Planner, gave a PowerPoint presentation that showed Location, Site Photos, existing Survey, building section diagram, floor Plans, roof plan, elevations and Partial Staff Conditions.

Chairperson Rose opened the hearing to the public.

The following speakers appeared before the Board:

- 1) Steve Cavanaugh, Scott Boyle speaker on behalf of DLR Group design team. In support of the project.
- 2) Diane Hampton- Westminster Plaza resident- Spoke as a neighbor regarding traffic concerns.

The members of the Board thanked the design team for working toward the Board's comments in the 2020 Courtesy Review, the evolution of some details, and the preservation of other features to make a good balance on this final project.

Chad Cowart MOVED to approve Item ARB2022-10046 subject to staff conditions Clarisse Gates SECONDED the motion, voted upon, and PASSED by unanimous voice vote (5 -0).

# **NEW BUSINESS:**

No Items

# **OTHER BUSINESS:**

A. Due to the COVID-19 pandemic, Board members may attend the Appearance Review Board meetings virtually via Zoom Webinar. If in person quorum is required, the Board Secretary will work with board members to determine if attendance will be in person or via Zoom. Board members are not permitted to attend by telephone only due to the inability to view visual presentations provided at the meeting for consideration of the projects to be recommended for approval/denial.

## B. ARB Minor Reviews completed since the August 18, 2022, ARB Meeting:

- 1. ARB2022-10040- Terry and Washington fencing
- 2. ARB2022-10044-Griffin Park Fencing
- 3. ARB2022-10048-Temporary art installation 808 W Church
- 4. ARB2022-10050- Urban Farm hydroponics 719 W Washington
- 5. ARB2022-10051- New Entry- 70 W Lucerne Cir
- C. Creative Village Development Review Committee Projects for Approval.
  - None

# **ADJOURMENT:**

Chairperson Jill Rose adjourned the meeting at approximately 3:21 p.m.

THE NEXT MEETING OF THE APPEARANCE REVIEW BOARD WILL BE THURSDAY, October 20, 2022, AT 2:00 PM

# STAFF PRESENT

Sarah Taitt, Assistant City Attorney II Richard Forbes, Appearance Review Official Gabriella Isaac, Recording Secretary

Walter Hawkins, Acting Executive Secretary

Walter Hawkins, Executive Secretary Fernanda Paronetto, City Planning Yesenia Martinez, Economic Development

Gabriella Isaac, Recording Secretary